

(<https://www.cambridge.org/core/societies/the-design-society>)



Proceedings of the Design Society: DESIGN Conference, Volume 1

pp. 2129-2138

This volume was published under a former title. [See this journal's title history.](#)

PRODUCT CIRCULARITY INDICATORS: WHAT CONTRIBUTIONS IN DESIGNING FOR A CIRCULAR ECONOMY?

Part of: [Socio-technical Issues in Design](#)

[M. Saidani](#) ^(a1) ^(a2), [H. Kim](#) ^(a1), [F. Cluzel](#) ^(a2), [Y. Leroy](#) ^(a2) ...

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/dsd.2020.76>

Published online by Cambridge University Press: 11 June 2020

Abstract

This paper investigates and questions the relevance of product-centric circularity indicators in a product design context. To do so, reviews of eco-design tools and critical analyses of circularity indicators at the micro level of circular economy implementation are combined with a new workshop experimenting four of these indicators with the aim to improve the circularity performance of an industrial product. On this basis, the four tool-based circularity indicators tested are mapped on the engineering design and development process, and are positioned among the pool of main eco-design tools.

Copyright

The Author(s), 2020. Published by Cambridge University Press

This is an Open Access article, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives licence (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/> (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>)), which permits non-commercial re-use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is unaltered and is properly cited. The written permission of Cambridge University Press must be obtained for commercial re-use or in order to create a derivative work.

Corresponding author

*michael.saidani@centralesupelec.fr (<mailto:michael.saidani@centralesupelec.fr>)

References

Hide All

Blessing, L. and Chakrabarti, A. (2009), *DRM, a Design Research Methodology*, Springer-Verlag London Limited.10.1007/978-1-84882-587-1 CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-1-84882-587-1>) | Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=DRM+a+Design+Research+Methodology&publication+year=2009&author=Blessing+L.&author=Chakrabarti+A.)

Blomsma, F. et al. (2019), "Developing a circular strategies framework for manufacturing companies to support circular economy-oriented innovation", *Journal of Cleaner Production*, In press.10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118271 CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118271>) | Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Developing+a+circular+strategies+framework+for+manufacturing+companies+to+support+circular+economy-oriented+innovation&publication+year=2019&author=Blomsma+F.&journal=Journal+of+Cleaner+Production&doi=10.1016/j.jclepro)

Bovea, M.D. and Pérez-Belis, V. (2012), "A taxonomy of ecodesign tools for integrating environmental requirements into the product design process", *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 20, pp. 61–71.10.1016/j.jclepro.2011.07.012 CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2011.07.012>) | Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=A+taxonomy+of+ecodesign+tools+for+integrating+environmental+requirements+into+the+product+design+process&publicaBelis+V.&journal=Journal+of+Cleaner+Production&volume=20&doi=10.1016/j.jclepro.2011.07.012&pages=61-71)

Bovea, M.D. and Pérez-Belis, V. (2018), "Identifying design guidelines to meet the circular economy principles: a case study on electric and electronic equipment", *J. Environ. Manag*, Vol. 228, pp. 483–494.10.1016/j.jenvman.2018.08.014 CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2018.08.014>) | Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Identifying+design+guidelines+to+meet+the+circular+economy+principles:+a+case+study+on+electric+and+electronic+equipBelis+V.&journal=J.+Environ.+Manag&volume=228&doi=10.1016/j.jenvman.2018.08.014&pages=483-494) | PubMed (<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/30248643>)

de Jesus, A. et al. (2018), "Eco-innovation in the transition to a circular economy: an analytical literature review", *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 172, pp. 2999–3018.10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.11.111

CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.11.111>) |
Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Eco-innovation+in+the+transition+to+a+circular+economy:+an+analytical+literature+review&publication+year=2018&author=de+Jesus+3018)

Franco, M.A. (2019), "A system dynamics approach to product design and business model strategies for the circular economy", *Journal of Cleaner Production*, In press.10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118327
CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118327>) |
Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=A+system+dynamics+approach+to+product+design+and+business+model+strategies+for+the+circular+economy&publication)

Geissdoerfer, M. et al. (2017), "The Circular Economy—A new sustainability paradigm?", *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 143, pp. 757–768.10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.12.048 CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.12.048>)
|
Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=The+Circular+Economy%E2%80%94A+new+sustainability+paradigm&publication+year=2017&author=Geissdoerfer+M.&journal=Journal+of+Cleaner+Production&volume=143&doi=10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.12.048)

Gente, V. and Pattanaro, G. (2019), "The place of eco-innovation in the current sustainability debate", *Waste Management*, Vol. 88, pp. 96–101.10.1016/j.wasman.2019.03.026
CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.wasman.2019.03.026>) |
Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=The+place+of+eco-innovation+in+the+current+sustainability+debate&publication+year=2019&author=Gente+V.&author=Pattanaro+G.&journal=Waste+Management)
| PubMed (<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/31079654>)

Hollander, M.C., Bakker, C.A. and Hultink, E.J. (2017), "Product Design in a Circular Economy: Development of a Typology of Key Concepts and Terms", *Journal of Industrial Ecology*, Vol. 21, pp. 517–525.10.1111/jiec.12610
CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/jiec.12610>) |
Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Product+Design+in+a+Circular+Economy:+Development+of+a+Typology+of+Key+Concepts+and+Terms&publication+year=2017)

Janik, A. and Ryszko, A. (2019), "Circular economy in companies: an analysis of selected indicators from a managerial perspective", *MAPE*, Vol. 2 No. 1, pp. 523–535.

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Circular+economy+in+companies:+an+analysis+of+selected+indicators+from+a+managerial+perspective&publication+year=:535)

Jugend, D. et al. (2020), "Achieving environmental sustainability with ecodesign practices and tools for new product development", In: Galanakis, C.M. (Ed.), *Innovation Strategies in Environmental Science*, Elsevier, pp. 179–207.10.1016/B978-0-12-817382-4.00006-X CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-817382-4.00006-X>) |

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Innovation+Strategies+in+Environmental+Science&publication+year=2020&author=Jugend+D.&author=Galanakis+C.M.&page=207)

Kravchenko, M., Pigosso, D.C.A. and McAloone, T.C. (2019), "Towards the ex-ante sustainability screening of circular economy initiatives in manufacturing companies: Consolidation of leading sustainability-related performance indicators", *Journal of Cleaner Production*, In press.10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118318

CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118318>) |

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Towards+the+ex-ante+sustainability+screening+of+circular+economy+initiatives+in+manufacturing+companies:+Consolidation+of+leading+sustainability+related+performance+indicators&publication+year=2019&author=Kravchenko+M.&author=Pigosso+D.C.A.&author=McAloone+T.C)

Kwok, S.Y. and Hallstedt, S.I. (2018), "Sustainable Product Development: Challenges and Opportunities for Communicating Sustainability in a Value Chain", *NordDesign 2018*, Linköping, Sweden, 14-17 August 2018.

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Sustainable+Product+Development:+Challenges+and+Opportunities+for+Communicating+Sustainability+in+a+Value+Chain&

https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Sustainable+Product+Development:+Challenges+and+Opportunities+for+Communicating+Sustainability+in+a+Value+Chain&

McAloone, T.C. and Bey, N. (2009), *Environmental improvement through product development: A guide*, Danish Environmental Protection Agency, Copenhagen, p. 48.

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Environmental+improvement+through+product+development:+A+guide&publication+year=2009&author=McAloone+T.C.&author=Bey+N

https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Environmental+improvement+through+product+development:+A+guide&publication+year=2009&author=McAloone+T.C.&author=Bey+N

Pahl, G. and Beitz, W. (2007), *Engineering Design: A Systematic Approach*, Springer-Verlag London.10.1007/978-1-84628-319-2 CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-1-84628-319-2>) |

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Engineering+Design:+A+Systematic+Approach&publication+year=2007&author=Pahl+G.&author=Beitz+W)

https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Engineering+Design:+A+Systematic+Approach&publication+year=2007&author=Pahl+G.&author=Beitz+W)

Parchomenko, A. et al. (2019), "Measuring the circular economy - A Multiple Correspondence Analysis of 63 metrics", *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 210, pp. 200–216.10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.10.357

CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.10.357>) |

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Measuring+the+circular+economy+-+A+Multiple+Correspondence+Analysis+of+63+metrics&publication+year=2019&author=Parchomenko+A.&journal=Journal+of+Cle+216)

Pigosso, D. and McAlloone, T.C. (2017), "How can design science contribute to a circular economy?", *Proceedings of the 21st International Conference on Engineering Design (ICED 17)*, Vancouver, Canada, August 21-25, 2017, Vol. 5, Design for X, pp. 299–307.

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=How+can+design+science+contribute+to+a+circular+economy?&publication+year=2017&author=Pigosso+D.&author=McAlloone+T.C.)

https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=How+can+design+science+contribute+to+a+circular+economy?&publication+year=2017&author=Pigosso+D.&author=McAlloone+T.C.

Ramani, K. et al. (2010), "Integrated Sustainable Life Cycle Design: A Review", *Journal of Mechanical Design*, Vol. 132, No. 8, pp. 1–15.10.1115/1.4002308 CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1115/1.4002308>) |

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Integrated+Sustainable+Life+Cycle+Design:+A+Review&publication+year=2010&author=Ramani+K.&journal=Journal+of+Mec+15)

https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Integrated+Sustainable+Life+Cycle+Design:+A+Review&publication+year=2010&author=Ramani+K.&journal=Journal+of+Mec+15

Rodrigues, V.P., Pigosso, D.C.A. and McAlloone, T.C. (2016), "Process-related key performance indicators for measuring sustainability performance of ecodesign implementation into product development", *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 139, pp. 416–428.10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.08.046

CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.08.046>) |

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Process-related+key+performance+indicators+for+measuring+sustainability+performance+of+ecodesign+implementation+into+product+428)

Ruiz-Pastor, L. et al. (2019), "Analysis of the circularity metrics applicability in the conceptual product design stage", *23rd International Congress on Project Management and Engineering*, Málaga, Spain, July 10-12, 2019.

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Analysis+of+the+circularity+metrics+applicability+in+the+conceptual+product+design+stage&publication+year=2019&author+Pastor+L.)

https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Analysis+of+the+circularity+metrics+applicability+in+the+conceptual+product+design+stage&publication+year=2019&author+Pastor+L.

Saidani, M. et al. (2016), "Time-efficient eco-innovation workshop process in complex system industries", *Proceedings of the 14th International Design Conference*, Dubrovnik, Croatia, May 16-19, 2016.

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Time-efficient+eco-innovation+workshop+process+in+complex+system+industries&publication+year=2016&author=Saidani+M.)

Saidani, M. (2018), *Monitoring and advancing the circular economy transition – Circularity indicators and tools applied to the heavy vehicle industry* [PhD thesis], Université Paris-Saclay.

Google Scholar ([https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Saidani+M.+
\(2018\)+Monitoring+and+advancing+the+circular+economy+transition+%E2%80%93+Circularity+indicators+and+tools+applied+to+Saclay.](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Saidani+M.+
(2018)+Monitoring+and+advancing+the+circular+economy+transition+%E2%80%93+Circularity+indicators+and+tools+applied+to+Saclay.))

Saidani, M. et al. (2019a), "A taxonomy of circular economy indicators", *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 207, pp. 542–559.10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.10.014 CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.10.014>) |

Google Scholar ([https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=A+taxonomy+of+circular+economy+indicators&publication+year=2019a&author=Saidani+M.&journal=Journal+of+Cleaner+Pr
559](https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=A+taxonomy+of+circular+economy+indicators&publication+year=2019a&author=Saidani+M.&journal=Journal+of+Cleaner+Pr
559))

Saidani, M. et al. (2019b), "Testing the robustness of circularity indicators: empirical insights from workshops on an industrial product", *Proceedings of the 20th International Conference on Engineering Design (ICED 19)*, Delft, Netherlands, August 2019.

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Testing+the+robustness+of+circularity+indicators:+empirical+insights+from+workshops+on+an+industrial+product&publicat

Smol, M., Kulczycka, J. and Avdiushchenko, A. (2017), "Circular economy indicators in relation to eco-innovation in European regions", *Clean Technol. Environ. Policy*, Vol. 19, pp. 669–678.10.1007/s10098-016-1323-8

CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10098-016-1323-8>) |
Google Scholar ([https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Circular+economy+indicators+in+relation+to+eco-innovation+in+European+regions&publication+year=2017&author=Smol+M.&author=Kulczycka+J.&author=Avdiushchenko+A.&jou
016-1323-8&pages=669-678](https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Circular+economy+indicators+in+relation+to+eco-innovation+in+European+regions&publication+year=2017&author=Smol+M.&author=Kulczycka+J.&author=Avdiushchenko+A.&jou
016-1323-8&pages=669-678))

Sustainn. (2018), *Zero-Waste Systems Engineering: A Process To Design Circular Products & Services*, Available at: <http://www.wearesustainn.com/en/metodologias/> (<http://www.wearesustainn.com/en/metodologias/>).

Google Scholar ([https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Sustainn.+
\(2018\)+Zero-Waste+Systems+Engineering:+A+Process+To+Design+Circular+Products+&+Services+Available+at:+http://www.wearesustainn.cor](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Sustainn.+
(2018)+Zero-Waste+Systems+Engineering:+A+Process+To+Design+Circular+Products+&+Services+Available+at:+http://www.wearesustainn.cor)

TheDesignExchange. (2017), *Design methods*. Available at: https://www.thedesignexchange.org/design_methods (https://www.thedesignexchange.org/design_methods).

Google Scholar ([https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=TheDesignExchange.+ \(2017\)+Design+methods.+Available+at:+https://www.thedesignexchange.org/design+methods.](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=TheDesignExchange+(2017)+Design+methods.+Available+at:+https://www.thedesignexchange.org/design+methods.))

Tyl, B. et al. (2014), "A comparative study of ideation mechanisms used in eco-innovation tools", *Journal of Engineering Design*, Vol. 25 No. 10-12, pp. 325–345.10.1080/09544828.2014.992772

CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09544828.2014.992772>) |

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=A+comparative+study+of+ideation+mechanisms+used+in+eco-innovation+tools&publication+year=2014&author=Tyl+B.&journal=Journal+of+Engineering+Design&volume=25&doi=10.1080/09544828.2014.992772)

Vallet, F. et al. (2016), "Research directions in eco-innovation: a French perspective", *Int J Interact Des Manuf*, Vol. 10, pp. 309–318.10.1007/s12008-016-0332-5 CrossRef (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s12008-016-0332-5>) |

Google Scholar (https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Research+directions+in+eco-innovation:+a+French+perspective&publication+year=2016&author=Vallet+F.&journal=Int+J+Interact+Des+Manuf&volume=10&doi=10.1007/s12008-016-0332-5&pages=309-318)